



City of Denton

City Hall
215 E. McKinney Street
Denton, Texas
www.cityofdenton.com

AGENDA INFORMATION SHEET

DEPARTMENT: Department of Development Services

DCM: David Gaines

DATE: August 8, 2022

SUBJECT

Hold a public meeting and consider an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accordance with Section 2.9.2 of the Denton Development Code, to remove the north elevator addition and restore/reconstruct the historic north and west elevations of the north façade at 221 N Elm Street, a local historic landmarked property and Recorded Historic Texas Landmark. The site is located on the southwest corner of N Elm Street and W McKinney Street. (COA22-0011, 221 N Elm Street - City Hall West, Cameron Robertson)

BACKGROUND

The applicant Architexas, on behalf of the City of Denton, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to demolish the non-original north elevator addition and restore/reconstruct the historic north and west elevations of the north façade at 221 N Elm Street. The proposed exterior alterations are limited to the north side of the building.

The non-original north elevator addition would be demolished, requiring the repair of the original Spanish tile roofline and the restoration/reconstruction of the original windows and door configuration. Cast stone detailing along the roofline and around the windows would be reconstructed to match the original detailing. The non-historic door and transom window will be constructed of wood and metal clad, with the non-historic windows constructed of wood with a Vanilla Cream metal clad finish to match the windows currently used throughout the remainder of the building, which were reviewed and approved by the Texas Historical Commission (THC) in 2019. As all interior work is not visible from the public right-of-way, the proposed interior renovations are not subject to COA review and not part of this request. Refer to Exhibit 4 – Project Narrative and Existing Conditions Photos, Exhibit 6 – Project Details, and Exhibit 7 – Wood Windows Installation Details.

The existing building is known as City Hall West or Old Denton City Hall. Constructed in 1927, the building is designed in the Spanish Renaissance Style.

As 221 N Elm Street is a Recorded Texas Historic Landmark (RTHL), the proposed project underwent an RTHL review with the THC [see Exhibit 5]. The RTHL review typically takes place before issuance of local COAs, in order for the HLC to take THC's RTHL guidance into consideration upon review. The Texas Historical Commission staff determined the scope of work appropriately met the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and waived the remainder of the RTHL review period.

Section 4.9.3A of the DDC requires a COA for any exterior work on a building, structure or land within a Historic District or designated a Historic Landmark:

No person shall construct, reconstruct, alter, remodel, renovate, restore, demolish, raze, or maintain any building, structure or land with a Historic Landmark designation or a building, structure or land located in a locally designated Historic or Conservation District unless application is made for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for said work and such a certificate is granted as provided in Subsection 2.9.2, and appropriate construction or demolition permits are obtained.

The HLC reviews COAs related to a historic building in terms of architectural compatibility, retention of significant architectural features, as well as compliance with The Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Additionally, the Denton Development Code (DDC) has other zoning regulations and design standards that are applicable with this application.

If the COA is approved by HLC, the next step for the applicant is to submit permit applications for the removal of the north elevator addition and reconstruction/restoration of the original exterior. During the review of the permit application, staff will ensure that the dimensional and development standards of the DDC and the requirements of City Building Codes are met.

CONSIDERATIONS

Section 2.9.2 of the DDC specifies the HPO and the HLC shall review the proposed project for compliance with The Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (The Standards), any applicable guidelines adopted by the City and any guidelines provided in Subchapter 2.9.

The proposed project is subject to review under the Standards for Rehabilitation. The Standards for Preservation, Restoration, and Reconstruction do not apply. Below are the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation requirements that apply.

Standards for Rehabilitation

Definition: Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.

1. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

The historic character of the property would be retained and preserved with the proposed demolition of the non-original north elevator addition and the reconstruction/restoration of the original windows and door configuration along the north and west elevations of the north facade of 221 N Elm Street. The removal of distinctive materials and alterations of features, spaces and spatial relationships would be avoided, as they are non-historic, restoring the building's original fenestration and architectural details.

2. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

The proposed project supports the 1927 property in serving as a physical record of its time, place and use. The proposed project would return the north facade to its original configuration. The non-historic north elevator addition has created a false sense of historical development, instituting conjectural features and elements from the original building. With the proposed project, the original windows and door configuration along the north and west elevations of the north facade would be reconstructed and restored with the alterations using a mixture of original material and non-historic materials. The proposed project more closely reflects the buildings original footprint from 1927.

3. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The proposed project would preserve and not disturb those distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques and examples of craftsmanship that characterize the property. The demolition of the north elevator addition would require the north and west elevations along the north façade to be restored and reconstructed to reflect those distinctive features that characterize the property. The original Spanish tile roofline would be restored, with the cast stone detailing along the roofline and around the windows reconstructed to match the original detailing. The non-historic door and transom window would be constructed of wood and metal clad, placed in their original location along the west elevation of the north façade and designed to match the originals. The non-historic windows would be constructed of wood with a Vanilla Cream metal clad finish to match the windows currently used throughout the remainder of the building.

4. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed removal of the north elevator addition and the restoration/reconstruction of the north and west elevations of the north façade would not destroy historic materials and features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The proposed project will be differentiated from the old with the use of predominately new materials for the windows, Spanish roof tiling, stone detailing, and doorway and would otherwise be compatible with the historic materials, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the building at 221 N Elm Street and its environment.

Based on the evaluation criteria stated above and an evaluation of the documentation, Staff believes that the demolition of the north elevator addition and restoration/reconstruction of the historic north and west elevations of the north façade at 221 N Elm Street meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

PREVIOUS ACTION/REVIEW

- COA20-0007: Historic Landmark Commission approved an application for replacement of existing windows.

NEIGHBORHOOD MEETING

Community Input Meeting: Downtown Business & Non-Profits

- Thursday, May 12, 2022
- Friday, May 13, 2022

Community Input Meeting: Open to the Public

- Tuesday, June 14, 2022

OPTIONS

1. Approval as submitted
2. Approval subject to conditions
3. Deny
4. Continue the item

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends **approval** of the Certificate of Appropriateness request to remove the north elevator addition and restore/reconstruct the historic north and west elevations of the north façade at 221 N Elm Street, as the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

EXHIBITS:

1. Agenda Information Sheet
2. Site Location Map
3. COA Application and Owner Authorization
4. Project Narrative and Existing Conditions Photos
5. Texas Historical Commission Review
6. Project Details
7. Wood Windows Installation Details

Respectfully submitted:
Tina Firgens, AICP
Deputy Director Development Services/
Planning Director

Prepared By:
Cameron Robertson, AICP
Historic Preservation Officer