# **City of Denton**



City Hall 215 E. McKinney Street Denton, Texas www.cityofdenton.com

# **AGENDA INFORMATION SHEET**

**DEPARTMENT:** Department of Development Services

**DCM:** Cassey Ogden

**DATE:** February 10, 2025

# **SUBJECT**

Hold a public meeting and consider an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accordance with Section 2.9.2 of the Denton Development Code, to replace exterior windows at 1011 W Oak Street, within the Oak-Hickory Historic District (OH). The site is located on the south side of W Oak Street between N Welch Street and Denton Street. (COA25-0001, 1011 W Oak Street, Cameron Robertson)

# **BACKGROUND**

The applicant and property owner Thomas Judd is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the removal of storm windows and replacement of 25 exterior windows on the main structure. The existing wooden framed, double-dung, single pane windows are proposed to be replaced with bronze finished, double-hung, single pane windows with dual pane glass to provide energy efficiency, durability, and noise reduction. The original window openings and style of the windows will not change, except for the material. The dark window frame color will remain the same. Refer to Exhibit 4 – COA Application and Owner Authorization and Exhibit 5 – Window Details. The existing residence was originally constructed in 1929 with an exterior alteration along the front façade circa 1949.

Section 4.9.3A of the DDC requires a COA for any exterior work on a building, structure or land within a Historic District:

No person shall construct, reconstruct, alter, remodel, renovate, restore, demolish, raze, or maintain any building, structure or land with a Historic Landmark designation or a building, structure or land located in a locally designated Historic or Conservation District unless application is made for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for said work and such a certificate is granted as provided in Subsection 2.9.2, and appropriate construction or demolition permits are obtained.

The HLC reviews COAs related to a historic building in terms of architectural compatibility, retention of significant architectural features, as well as compliance with The Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Additionally, the Denton Development Code (DDC) has other zoning regulations and design standards that are applicable with this application.

If the COA is approved by HLC, the next step for the applicant is to submit a permit application to replace the exterior windows. During the review of the permit application, staff will ensure that the dimensional and development standards of the DDC and the requirements of City Building Codes are met.

## **CONSIDERATIONS**

Section 2.9.2 of the DDC specifies the HPO and the HLC shall review the proposed project for compliance with The Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (The Standards), any applicable guidelines adopted by the City and any guidelines provided in Subchapter 2.9.

Section 4.9.4C of the DDC specifies the architectural requirements in the Oak-Hickory Historic District. Below are the relevant architectural requirements that apply to the subject application:

## **Architectural Detail**

Materials, colors, structural, and decoration elements and the manner in which they are used, applied, or joined together must be compatible with nearby and adjacent structures.

Many of the structures along W Oak Street appear to have double-hung, single pane windows of both wood and newer materials. Along the street, the colors of the window frames vary in color. Therefore, the proposed materials and colors would be compatible with those used along W Oak Street. Additionally, the structural and decorative elements proposed would be compatible with nearby and adjacent structures, as they are proposed to be double-hung, single pane windows to match the existing style of the windows.

# **Windows and Doors**

- a. **Front Façade Openings**: The location and size of windows and doors in proposed façades must be compatible in scale with the typical style and period of the main building. *The original window openings (size and location) would not change with the replacement of the windows; therefore, remaining compatible in scale with the typical style and period of the main building.*
- b. Glass: Reflective, tinted, and mirrored glass and plastic are not permitted in any opening. The proposed windows would not use reflective, tinted, nor mirrored glass or plastic in the window openings. The proposed windows would be dual paned, instead of single pane to provide better energy efficiency and noise reduction. The removal of the old storm windows will help improve the exterior appearance of the historic residence.
- c. **Style**: All windows and doors in the front façade of the main building must be proportionally balanced in a manner typical of the style and period of the building. The proposed windows style in the front façade would be proportionally balanced in a manner typical of the style and period of the building. Presently the windows are single-pane, double-hung windows. The proposed window replacements along the front, rear and side façades would be single pane, double-hung windows.
- d. **Size**: The size and proportion of window and door openings located on the front and sides of the main building must be typical of the style and period of the main building. The size and proportion of the window openings on the front, rear, and sides of the main building would remain the same; therefore, remaining typical of the style and period of the main building.
- e. **Frames**: The frames of the windows must be trimmed in a manner typical of the style and period of the building.
  - The proposed windows would not be trimmed in a manner typical of the style and period of the building; the proposed windows would be trimmed in Ultrex fiberglass instead of wood. In addition, the existing storm windows would be removed. However, residences along W Oak Street have started replacing older wooden double-hung, single pane windows with newer framing materials, providing for greater durability and continued compatibility along the W Oak Street corridor.
- f. **Openings**: All windows, doors, and lights in the front and side façades of the main building must be typical of the style and period of the building. Sidelights must be compatible with the door.

The original window openings on the front, rear, and side facades of the main building would not change with the replacement of the windows; therefore, remaining typical of the style and period of the building.

As previously stated, the proposed project is subject to review under the Standards for Rehabilitation. The Standards for Preservation, Restoration, and Reconstruction do not apply. Below are the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation requirements.

#### **Standards for Rehabilitation**

Definition: Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.

1. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

The historic character of the building at 1011 W Oak Street will be retained and preserved. Distinctive materials, such as the wooden framed windows, will be removed. However, the existing single pane, double-hung windows seen on many of the residences in the neighborhood would be retained and preserved, and none of the spaces nor spatial relationships that characterize the building will be altered or removed. Though distinctive materials would be removed, the proposed replacement windows would continue to preserve those features that convey the building's historical and architectural values.

- 2. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
  - The proposed project does not create a false sense of historical development.
- 3. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
  - The proposed project will disturb the original wooden framed windows (distinctive materials) and finishes of the building. However, the features and construction techniques that characterize the building at 1011 W Oak Street will be preserved physically with proposed replacement windows that match in size and design of the original circa 1949 windows, and match in color with those windows presently on the residence.
- 4. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
  - The deteriorated historic features will not be repaired, as the wooden windows are not energy efficient and have created air leakage in the building, causing increased road noise and allowing for dust to enter the home. Additionally, over the last 70+ years, the windows have been caulked and/or painted shut, causing damage and making the windows unusable, and needing additional protection by storm windows. The proposed windows would not match the old in texture, nor material; yet the proposed color would be compatible with the window framing currently on the structure and the materials and texture would be compatible with those used for other structures located in the area and along W Oak Street. The structural and decorative elements (design) proposed would be compatible with nearby and adjacent structures, as well as with the present building, as they are proposed to be double-hung, single pane windows to match the existing window pattern.

5. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project would incorporate the replacement of windows to the building at 1011 W Oak Street. The proposed project would remove historic materials and features; however, the exterior alterations will not negatively affect the spatial relationships that characterize the property. The proposed project will be differentiated from the old with the use of Ultrex fiberglass and would otherwise be compatible with the historic materials, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the building at 1011 W Oak Street and its environment.

Based on the evaluation criteria stated above and an evaluation of the documentation, staff believes that the new 25 replacement windows meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation requirements and Section 4.9.4C of the Denton Development Code.

# PREVIOUS ACTION/REVIEW

No previous action/review.

## **NEIGHBORHOOD MEETING**

No neighborhood meeting was held.

# **OPTIONS**

- 1. Approval as submitted
- 2. Approval subject to conditions
- 3. Deny
- 4. Continue the item

# RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends **approval as submitted** of the Certificate of Appropriateness request to replace the 25 main residence windows at 1011 W Oak Street, as the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Section 4.9.4C of the Denton Development Code.

# **EXHIBITS:**

- 1. Agenda Information Sheet
- 2. Site Location Map
- 3. Oak-Hickory Historic District Map
- 4. COA Application and Owner Authorization
- 5. Window Details

Respectfully submitted: Tina Firgens, AICP Deputy Director Development Services/ Planning Director

Prepared By: Cameron Robertson, AICP Historic Preservation Officer